

Medical History and Bioethics/Philosophy 558

Syllabus for Ethical Problems Raised by Biomedical Technology
Spring 2010

Instructors:	Phone	E-mail
Norman Fost, M. D., M. P. H.	263-8562	ncfost@wisc.edu
Robert Streiffer, Ph.D.	263-9479	rstreiffer@facstaff.wisc.edu
Emily McRae	263-3700	emcrae@wisc.edu

Organization: This class meets Tuesdays from 11:00 – 12:15 for lectures, and on Thursdays at the times below for small group discussions. This is a survey course in bioethics, for advanced undergraduates and graduate students. Our goal is to familiarize students with the range of issues and arguments found in the literature of bioethics, and to encourage independent and critical thinking and writing on these topics.

Lecture: Tuesdays, 11:00 – 12:15, Nutritional Science 290

Discussions: Thursdays

DIS 302	11:00-12:15	White 7121	McRae
DIS 303	9:30 – 10:45	White 7121	McRae
DIS 304	2:30– 3:45	Psych 210	Varness

Office Hours:

Emily McRae	W 9:30-10:30	5119 Helen C. White Hall
Todd Varness	By appointment	

Reading: The primary text for the course is *Ethical Issues in Modern Medicine*, by Bonnie Steinbock, John Arras, and Alex London (7th Edition, 2009). It is available at University Bookstore. Page numbers that follow are keyed to this book. Other readings for this course will be available on the Ebling Library website through MyUW. .

Grading: Students will be evaluated on the basis of weekly quizzes (20% total), based on the readings for that week; a 1200 – 1500 word (4 – 5 page) mid-term paper (30%), and a 2400 – 3000 word (8 – 10 page) final paper (50%). Put your name and discussion section on the first page of the paper, along with a final word count. Papers must be submitted either on disk or by e-mail attachment (to facilitate written comments by the instructor), but a printed copy must be hand delivered at the beginning of class on the due date to confirm that the paper has been received. The final grade can be raised or lowered by unusually constructive participation in discussion, or by an unusual lack of it. The mid-term paper is due at the beginning of class, March 11; the final paper at the beginning of class May 6. Never turn in the only copy of your paper.

Attendance: Attendance at lectures and discussion groups is required and can affect your grade. Minimum attendance for a passing grade = 12 lectures and 12 discussion sessions.

Students who anticipate needing an “incomplete” grade should read carefully the University’s policy, at http://registrar.wisc.edu/students/acadrecords/grades_and_policy/the_incomplete.php.

Students considering dropping the course should read that policy, at: http://www.lssaa.wisc.edu/70bascom/academic_policy/drop.html

Schedule:

1.	1/19	Introduction	Fost
-----------	-------------	---------------------	-------------

- (a) Film: "Who Shall Survive"
- (b) "Introduction: Moral Reasoning in the Medical Context", 1 – 41 EIMM

2.	1/26	Abortion	Streiffer
-----------	-------------	-----------------	------------------

- (a) "Why Abortion is Immoral" by Don Marquis, 547-555 EIMM
- (b) "A Defense of Abortion" by Judith Jarvis Thomson, 567-575 EIMM

Optional Reading:

- (c) "Why Most Abortions Are Not Wrong" by Bonnie Steinbock, 471-482 EIMM
- (e) "The Morality of Abortion" by Margaret Olivia Little, 492 – 500 EIMM

3.	2/2	Stem Cells / Cloning	Streiffer
-----------	------------	-----------------------------	------------------

- (a) President's Council on Bioethics, "The Case Against Cloning-to-Produce-Children," 637-650. EIMM
- (b) Steinbock, "Reproductive Cloning: Another Look," 651-661. EIMM
- (c) Sandel, "Embryo Ethics – The Moral Logic of Stem Cell Research," 707-709 EIMM
- (d) George and Lee, "Acorns and Embryos," 709-715
- (g) Fitzpatrick, "Surplus Embryos, Nonreproductive Cloning, and the Intend/Foresee Distinction," 716-723

3.	2/9	Experimentation	Lederer
-----------	------------	------------------------	----------------

- (a) "The Nuremberg Code," 739-740 EIMM
- (b) "The Jewish Chronic Disease Hospital Case," by John D. Arras, 740-749 EIMM
- (c) "The Willowbrook Hepatitis Studies," by David J. Rothman and Sheila M. Rothman, 749-753 EIMM
- (d) "The Willowbrook Hepatitis Studies Revisited," Saul Krugman (available on reserves, from 6th edition)
- (e) "Racism and Research: The Case of the Tuskegee Syphilis Study," Allan Brandt, 753-763 EIMM
- (f) "Tuskegee Re-Examined," Richard Shweder.
<http://www.spikedonline.com/sections/essays/index.htm> (Available on website)
- (g) "Unethical Trials on Interventions to Reduce Perinatal Transmission of the Human Immunodeficiency Virus in Developing Countries" by Lurie and Wolfe, 783-788 EIMM
- (h) "AZT Trials and Tribulations," by Crouch and Arras, 788-793 EIMM

5.	2/16	Consent	Schwarze
-----------	-------------	----------------	-----------------

- (a) Arras, "Antihypertensives and the risk of temporary impotence: a case study in informed consent," 87-88 EIMM
- (b) Katz, "Informed consent--must it remain a fairy tale?" 89-96 EIMM

- (c) Blackhall et al, "Bioethics in a Different Tongue: The Case of Truth-Telling," 101-109 EIMM
- (d) Freedman, "Offering Truth," 110-116 EIMM
- (e) Wynia M. "Invoking Therapeutic Privilege," Virtual mentor. Feb 2004, Vol 6, #2.
<http://virtualmentor.ama-assn.org/2004/02/msoc1-0402.html>

6.	2/23	Paternalism and Public Health	Kelleher
-----------	-------------	--------------------------------------	-----------------

(a) Wertheimer, Alan, "Liberty, Coercion, and the Limits of the State."

- (b) Goodin, Robert, "Permissible Paternalism, in defense of the nanny state"
- (c) Sullum, Jacob, "An Epidemic of Meddling: The totalitarian implications of public health."

7.	3/2	Foregoing Life-Sustaining Rx	Fagan
-----------	------------	-------------------------------------	--------------

- (a) State of Tennessee Department of Human Services v. Mary C. Northern, 361-365 EIMM
- (b) "Transcript of Proceedings: Testimony of Mary C. Northern," 365-368 EIMM
- (d) "A Chronicle: Dax's Case As It Happened," by Keith Burton, 379-383 EIMM
- (e) "Commentary," by Robert B. White, 383-384 EIMM
- (f) "Commentary," by H. Tristram Engelhardt, Jr. 384-385 EIMM
- (g) "The Health Care Proxy and the Living Will," by George J. Annas, 387-391 EIMM
- (h) "Enough: The Failure of the Living Will," by Fagerlin and Schneider, 391-401 EIMM
- (i) "Testing the Limits of Prospective Autonomy: Five Scenarios" by Norman L. Cantor, 402-403 EIMM
- (j) "Erring on the Side of Theresa Schiavo: Reflections of the Special Guardian and Litem," by Jay Wolfson, 405-409 EIMM
- (k) "Human Non-Person": Terri Schiavo, Bioethics, and our Future" by Wesley Smith, 409-410 EIMM
- (l) "Quality of Life and Non-Treatment Decisions for Incompetent Patients: A Critique of the Orthodox Approach," by Rebecca S. Dresser and John A. Robertson, 436-447 EIMM
- (m) "The Limits of Legal Objectivity," by Nancy K. Rhoden, 447-454 EIMM

8.	3/9	Foregoing Treatment Of Children: The Baby Doe Story	Fost
-----------	------------	--	-------------

- (a) "Counseling Families and Deciding Care of Severely Defective Children: A Way of Coping with 'Medical Vietnam'," by Raymond S. Duff (on e-reserve)
- (b) "Counseling Families Who Have a Child with a Severe Congenital Anomaly" by Norman Fost (on e-reserve)
- (c) "Extreme Prematurity and Parental Rights after *Baby Doe*" by John Robertson, 459-467 Eimm

Optional Reading:

- (d) *Montalvo v Borkovec* (on e-reserve)

9.	3/16	Genetic Screening	Ossorio
-----------	-------------	--------------------------	----------------

- (a) “The Introduction of Cystic Fibrosis Carrier Screening into Clinical Practice: Policy Considerations,” by Benjamin S. Wilfond and Norman Fost, (available on e-reserves, from 6th ed, pp. 501-512)
- (b) “Ethical Issues and Practical Problems in Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis,” Jeffrey R. Botkin, 694-704 EIMM
- (c) “Reproductive Freedom and Prevention of Genetically Transmitted Conditions,” Allen Buchanan, Dan W Brock, Norman Daniels, Daniel Wikler, 588-594 EIMM
- (d) “Genetics and the Moral Mission of Health Insurance” by Thomas H Murray, (available on e-reserves, from 6th ed pp. 557-562)
- (e) “Screening for Rare Genetic Disorders Now Routine in Newborns” by Roni Caryn Rabin, *The New York Times* February 18, 2009

Available at the following website:

<http://www.nytimes.com/2009/02/19/health/18screening.html?scp=3&sq=genetic%20screening&st=cse>

	3/23	The Wisconsin Cystic Fibrosis Newborn Screening Study	Fost
--	-------------	--	-------------

- (a) Fost NC and Farrell PM. “A Prospective randomized trial of early diagnosis and treatment of cystic fibrosis: a unique ethical dilemma,” *Clinical Research*, 37(3):495-500, 1989. (available on e-reserves)

******March 30*********Spring Break*******

12.	4/6	Human Growth Hormone: Treatment vs. Enhancement	Varness
------------	------------	--	----------------

- (a) “hGH for Short Stature: Ethical Issues Raised by Expanded Access,” David B. Allen and Norman Fost (available on e-reserves)
- (b) “Is Short Stature a Problem? The Psychological View,” Linda D. Voss (available on e-reserves)
- (c) “Growth Hormone Treatment for Idiopathic Short Stature: Implications for Practice and Policy,” Leona Cuttler (available on e-reserves)
- (d) “Using Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis to Save a Sibling: The Story of Molly and Adam Nash,” by Steinbock, 704-706 EIMM
- (e) “Genetic interventions and the Ethics of Enhancement of Human Beings,” by Savulescu, 879- 889 EIMM
- (f) “The case against perfection: What’s Wrong with Designer Children, Bionic Athletes, and Genetic Engineering,” By Sandel, 890-899 EIMM

13.	4/13	The Definition of Death	Fost
------------	-------------	--------------------------------	-------------

- (a) “The Definition of Death,” President’s Commission, 339-348 EIMM
- (b) “The Whole-Brain Concept of Death Remains Optimum Public Policy,” by James L. Bernat, 348-356. EIMM
- (c) “An Alternative to Brain Death,” by Jeff McMahan, 356-360 EIMM

- (d) “Reconsidering the dead donor rule: Is it important that organ donors be dead?” Fost N., Kennedy Institute of Ethics Journal 14(3):249-260, 2004 (available on website)

14.	4/20	Justice, Health and Health Care	Kelleher
------------	-------------	--	-----------------

- (a) President’s Commission, “An Ethical Framework for Access to Health Care”, 191-199 EIMM
 (b) Norman Daniels, “Equal Opportunity and Health Care,” 200-202 EIMM
 (c) H. Tristram Engelhardt, Jr., “Freedom and Moral Diversity: The Moral Failures of Health Care in the Welfare State,” 203-212 EIMM
 (d) “Social Determinants of Health: The Solid Facts,” 213-222 EIMM
 (e) Ichiro Kawachi, “Why the United States is Not Number One in Health,” 222-230 EIMM
 (f) Norman Daniels, “Justice, Health, and Healthcare,” 231-234 EIMM
 (g) Gopal Sreenivasan, “Opportunity is Not the Key,” 235-236 EIMM

13.	4/27	The Ashley X Case	Fost / Schalick
------------	-------------	--------------------------	------------------------

- (a) Daniel F. Gunther, MD, MA; Douglas S. Diekema, MD, MPH. “Attenuating Growth in Children With Profound Developmental Disability: A New Approach to an Old Dilemma,” . *Arch Pediatr Adolesc Med.* 2006;160:1013-1017. (available on e-reserves)
 (b) Brosco J, Feudtner C., “Growth attenuation: a diminutive solution to a daunting problem. *Arch Pediatr Adol Med* 2006 (Oct);160:1077-1078. (available on e-reserves)
 (c) Parents of Ashley. The Ashley Treatment.
<http://ashleytreatment.spaces.live.com/blog/cns!E25811FD0AF7C45C!1837.entry>
 (d) Eva Kittay and Jeffrey Kittay. Whose Convenience? Whose Truth? A Comment on Peter Singer's "A Convenient Truth"

http://www.thehastingscenter.org/Bioethicsforum/Post.aspx?id=350&terms=kittay+and+%23filename+*.html

- (e) Singer P. A convenient truth about disability. *Intl Herald Tribune.* Friday, January 27, 2007 (available on e-reserves)
 (f) “Prenatal Diagnosis and Selective Abortion: A Challenge to Practice and Policy” by Adrienne Asch, 675- 685 EIMM
 (g) “Disability, Prenatal Testing, and Selective Abortion” by Steinbock, 686-694 EIMM

Optional Reading:

- (h) S. Matthew Liao, Julian Savulescu, and Mark Sheehan, “The Ashley Treatment: Best Interests, Convenience, and Parental Decision-Making,” *Hastings Center Report* 37, no. 2 (2007): 16-20. (available on e-reserves)

15.	5/4	Performance Enhancing Drugs	Fost
------------	------------	------------------------------------	-------------

- (a) Norman Fost, “Ethical and Social Issues in Anti-Doping Strategies in Sport etc.,” (available on e-reserves)
 (b) Norm Fost, “Ben Johnson: The World’s Fastest Scapegoat,” *The New York Times*, Oct. 20, 1988 (available on e-reserves)

- (c) Norm Fost, “Let ‘em Take Steroids,” The New York Times, September 9, 1983.
(available on e-reserves)
- (d) Thomas Murray, “The Coercive Power of Drugs in Sports Hastings Center Report, August 1983, 24 – 30. (available on e-reserves)
- (e) “We should accept performance-enhancing drugs in competitive sports” Costas B, Moderator. Debate transcript and audio. (links available on website)
<http://intelligencesquaredus.org/index.php/past-debates/we-should-accept-performance-enhancing-drugs-in-competitive-sports/>