

Medical History and Bioethics 558
Ethical Problems Raised by Biomedical Technology
Spring 2003

| Instructors: | Phone | E-mail |
|-------------------------------|----------|------------------------------|
| Norman Fost, M. D., M. P. H.: | 263-8562 | ncfost@wisc.edu |
| Alta Charo, J. D.: | 262-5015 | racharo@facstaff.wisc.edu |
| Julie Fagan, M. D.: | 263-0150 | jrfagan@facstaff.wisc.edu |
| Robert Streiffer, Ph.D. : | 263-9479 | rstreiffer@facstaff.wisc.edu |
| Tasia Persson (TA) | 263-2767 | trpersson@students.wisc.edu |

Organization: This class meets Tuesdays from 11:00 – 12:15 for lectures, and on Thursdays at the times below for small group discussions. This is a survey course in bioethics, for advanced undergraduates and graduate students. Our goal is to familiarize students with the range of issues and arguments found in the literature of bioethics, and to encourage independent and critical thinking and writing on these topics.

Lecture: Tuesdays, 11:00 – 12:15, 594 Van Hise

Discussions: Thursdays

| | | | |
|---------|---------------|-------------------|----------------|
| DIS 301 | 11:00 – 12:15 | 355 Van Hise | Fost and Fagan |
| DIS 302 | 11:00 – 12:15 | 119 Van Hise | Persson |
| DIS 303 | 9:30 – 10:45 | 374 Van Hise | Persson |
| DIS 304 | 1:00 – 2:15 | 116 Ingraham Hall | Persson |

Reading: The primary text for the course is *Ethical Issues in Modern Medicine*, by Bonnie Steinbock, John Arras, and Alex London (6th Edition, 2003). It is available at University Bookstore. Page numbers which follow are keyed to this book.

Grading: Students will be evaluated on the basis of seven short, unannounced quizzes (20% total), based on the readings for that week; a 1200 – 1500 word (4 – 5 page) mid-term paper (30%), and a 2400 – 3000 word (8 – 10 page) final paper (50%). Please put your name and discussion section on the first page of the paper, along with a final word count. Papers must be submitted either on disk or by e-mail attachment, but either a disk or printed copy must be delivered on the due date. The final grade can be raised or lowered by unusually constructive participation in discussion, or by an unusual lack of it. The mid-term paper is due at the beginning of class, Feb 27; the final paper at the beginning of class Apr 24. Never turn in the only copy of your paper.

Schedule

| | | | | |
|-----------|-----------------|--|---------------------------------|------------------|
| 1. | 1/21 | Introduction | Fost | 1-41 |
| | | (a) Film: “Who Shall Survive”? | | |
| | | (b) “Introduction: Moral Reasoning in the Medical Context”, 1 – 41 | | |
| 2. | 1/28, Tu | Theory and Bioethics | Ossorio, Streiffer, Fost | |
| | | (a) “Introduction: Moral Reasoning in the Medical Context”, 1 – 41 | | |
| 3. | 2/4 | Abortion | Charo | 461-500 |
| | | (a) “The Unspeakable Crime of Abortion” by Pope John Paul II, 461 - 462 | | |
| | | (b) “Why Abortion is Immoral” by Don Marquis, 463 – 470 | | |
| | | (c) “Why Most Abortions Are Not Wrong” by Bonnie Steinbock, 471-482 | | |
| | | (d) “A Defense of Abortion” by Judith Jarvis Thomson, 483 – 491 | | |
| | | (e) “The Morality of Abortion” by Margaret Olivia Little, 492 – 500 | | |
| 4. | 2/11 | Assisted Reproductive Technologies | Charo | 595 – 630 |
| | | (a) “The Presumptive Primacy of Procreative Liberty” by John Robertson, 595-604 | | |
| | | (b) “Instruction on Respect for Human Life in Its Origin and on the Dignity of Procreation”, by the Vatican, Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, 605-614 | | |
| | | (c) “What is Wrong with Commodification” by Ruth Macklin, 615 – 624 | | |
| | | (d) “Selling Babies and Selling Bodies” by Sara Ann Ketchum, 625-630 | | |
| 5. | 2/18 | Human Embryonic Stem Cells and Cloning | Fost | 631 – 682 |
| | | (a) “Cloning Human Beings: An Assessment of Ethical Issues Pro and Con” by Dan W. Brock, 631-642 | | |
| | | (b) “Preventing a Brave new World: Why We Should Ban Human Cloning Now” by Leon R. Kass, 643 – 655 | | |
| | | (c) “Human Cloning: Myths, Medical Benefits, and Constitutional Rights” by Mark D. Eibert, 656 – 664 | | |
| | | (d) “Even If It Worked, Cloning Wouldn’t Bring Her Back” by Thomas H. Murray, 665 – 667 | | |
| | | (e) “Respect for Human Embryos” by Bonnie Steinbock, 668 – 671 | | |
| | | (f) “Creating Embryos for Research: Weighing Symbolic Costs” by Maura A. Ryan, 672 – 682 | | |
| 6. | 2/25 | Agricultural Biotechnology | Streiffer | |
| | | Readings: Enviropigs Case Study | | |
| 7. | 3/4 | Truth-telling and Paternalism | Fost | 56 – 82 |
| | | (a) “The Refutation of Medical Paternalism” by Alan Goldman, 56 - 63 | | |
| | | (b) “Beneficence Today, or Autonomy (Maybe) Tomorrow?”, 64 | | |
| | | (c) “Commentary” by Bernice S. Elger, 65 – 66 | | |

- (d) “Commentary” by Jean-Claude Chevrolet, 66
- (e) “Four Models of the Physician-Patient Relationship” by Ezekiel J. Emanuel and Linda L. Emanuel, 67-75
- (f) “Offering Truth” by Benjamin Freedman, 76 – 82

| | | | | |
|-----------|-------------|------------------------------------|------------|-----------------|
| 8. | 3/11 | Consent and Confidentiality | TBA | 83 – 106 |
|-----------|-------------|------------------------------------|------------|-----------------|

- (a) Arato v. Avedon, 83 - 90
- (b) “Antihypertensives and the Risk of Temporary Impotence: A Case Study in Informed Consent” by John D. Arras, 91
- (c) “Informed Consent—Must It Remain a Fairy Tale?” by Jay Katz, 92 – 99
- (d) “Transparency: Informed Consent in Primary Care” by Howard Brody, 100 – 106

| | | | | |
|--|-------------|---------------------|--|--|
| | 3/18 | Spring Break | | |
|--|-------------|---------------------|--|--|

| | | | | |
|-----------|-------------|--|--------------|--|
| 9. | 3/25 | Foregoing Life Sustaining Treatment | Fagan | |
|-----------|-------------|--|--------------|--|

- (a) State of Tennessee Department of Human Services v. Mary C. Northern, 283 - 286
- (b) “Transcript of Proceedings: Testimony of Mary C. Northern” 287 - 289
- (c) “Deciding for Others: Competency” by Allen Buchanan and Dan W. Brock, 290 - 300
- (d) “A Chronicle: Dax’s Case As It Happened” by Keith Burton, 301 - 304
- (e) “Commentary” by Robert B. White, 305 - 306
- (f) “Commentary” by H. Tristram Engelhardt, Jr. 307 – 308
- (g) “The Living Will: Help or Hindrance?” by Stuart J. Eisendrath and Albert R. Jonsen, 309 - 315
- (h) “The Health Care Proxy and the Living Will” by George J. Annas, 316 – 319
- (i) “Testing the Limits of Prospective Autonomy: Five Scenarios” by Norman L. Cantor, 320 - 322
- (i) “The Severely Demented, Minimally Functional Patient: An Ethical Analysis” by John D. Arras, 333-340
- (j) “Quality of Life and Non-Treatment Decisions for Incompetent Patients: A Critique of the Orthodox Approach” by Rebecca S. Dresser and John A. Robertson, 357 - 367
- (k) “The Limits of Legal Objectivity” by Nancy K. Rhoden, 368 - 376

| | | | | |
|------------|------------|--|------------------|------------------|
| 10. | 4/1 | Euthanasia and Physician-Assisted Suicide | Streiffer | 377 – 425 |
|------------|------------|--|------------------|------------------|

- (a) “Death and Dignity: A Case of Individualized Decision Making” by Timothy E. Quill, 377 – 380
- (b) “Patient Request Form for Oregon’s Death with Dignity Act”, 381
- (c) “Assisted Suicide: The Philosophers’ Brief, Introduction” by Ronald Dworkin, 382 – 385
- (d) “The Philosopher’s Brief” by Ronald Dworkin, Thomas Nagel, Robert Nozick, John Rawls, Thomas Scanlon, and Judith Jarvis Thomson, 386 – 393
- (e) “Physician-Assisted Suicide: A Tragic View” by John D. Arras, 394 – 400

- (f) “Euthanasia: The Way We Do It, the Way They Do It” by Margaret Battin, 401 – 415
- (g) ”Is There a Duty to Die?” by John Hardwig, 416 – 425

| | | | | |
|------------|------------|--|----------------|--|
| 11. | 4/8 | Human Experimentation | Ossorio | |
| | | (a) “The Nuremburg Code”, 705 | | |
| | | (b) “The Jewish Chronic Disease Hospital Case” by Jay Katz, 706 | | |
| | | (c) “Rebuttal Affidavits for Respondent” by Chester M. Southam and Emanuel E. Mandel, 707 – 709 | | |
| | | (d) “How and by Whom Should the Consequences of Research Be Reviewed,” 710 | | |
| | | (e) “The Willowbrook Hepatitis Studies” by David J. Rothman and Sheila M. Rothman, 718 – 721 | | |
| | | (f) “The Willowbrook Hepatitis Studies Revisited: Ethical Aspects” by Saul Krugman, 722 – 726 | | |
| | | (g) “Racism and Research: The Case of the Tuskegee Syphilis Study” by Allan M. Brandt, 727 – 737 | | |
| | | (h) “Ethical Difficulties with Randomized Clinical Trials Involving Cancer Patients: Examples from the Field of Gynecological Oncology” by Maurie Markman, 747 – 749 | | |
| | | (i) “Of Mice but Not Men: Problems of the Randomized Clinical Trial” by Samuel Hellman and Deborah S. Hellman, 750 – 754 | | |
| | | (j) “A Response to a Purported Ethical Difficulty with Randomized Clinical Trails Involving Cancer Patients” by Benjamin Freedman, 755 – 760 | | |
| | | (k) “Unethical Trials of Interventions to Reduce Perinatal Transmission of the Human Immunodeficiency Virus in Developing Countries” by Peter Lurie and Sidney M. Wolfe, 761 – 765 | | |

| | | | | |
|------------|-------------|---|----------------|--|
| 12. | 4/15 | Genetic Screening | Ossorio | |
| | | (a) “The Introduction of Cystic Fibrosis Carrier Screening into Clinical Practice: Policy Considerations” by Benjamin S. Wilfond and Norman Fost, 501 – 512 | | |
| | | (b) “Genetics and the Moral Mission of Health Insurance” by Thomas H Murray | | |
| | | (c) “Patient Autonomy and Value Neutrality in Nondirective Counseling,” by Robert Wachbroit and David Wasserman | | |

| | | | | |
|------------|-------------|--|----------------|--|
| 13. | 4/22 | Race and Ethnicity in Health Care | Ossorio | |
| | | (a) “Race and Genomics” by Richard Cooper, Jay Kaufman, and Ryk Ward. In NEJM 348:12 March 20, 2003, 1166-1170 | | |
| | | (b) “The Importance of Race and Ethnic Background in Biomedical Research and Clinical Practice,” by Burchard et. al. In NEJM 348: 12 1170-1175 | | |
| | | (c) “Medicine and the Racial Divide” by Elizabeth G. Phimister. In NEJM 348: 12 1081-1082 | | |

| | | | | |
|------------|-------------|---|----------------|--|
| 14. | 4/29 | Markets in Health Care | Hausman | |
| | | (a) “Health Care Allowances: Market Dynamics in a Publicly-Funded System” by Fred McMahon, at http://www.nextcity.com/cpi/healthcare/july700.html . | | |

- (b) ““Make or buy” decisions in the production of health care goods and services: new insights from institutional economics and organizational theory” by Alexander Preker, April Harding, and Phyllida Travis, at <http://www.who.int/bulletin/pdf/2000/issue6/bu0606.pdf>.
- (c) “Health Care: Efficiency and Equity” by Dan Hausman. In *Ethical Dimensions of Geriatric Care*, edited by Spicker, Ingman, and Lawson, 67-78.
- (d) Recommended by not required: “Health Care Reform: The Good, the Bad, and the Ugly,” by Michael Tanner, at <http://www.cato.org/pubs/pas/pa184>.

| | | | | |
|------------|------------|-------------------------|-------------|--|
| 15. | 5/6 | Drugs and Sports | Fost | |
|------------|------------|-------------------------|-------------|--|

- (a) Norm Fost. “Banning drugs in sports: a skeptical view,” *Hastings Center Report*, August 1986, 5 – 10.
- (b) Norm Fost, “Stop the Hassle about Drugs,” *USA Today*, Sept. 16 – 18, 1988
- (c) Norm Fost, “Ben Johnson: The World’s Fastest Scapegoat,” *The New York Times*, Oct. 20, 1988
- (d) Norm Fost, “Let ‘em Take Steroids,” *The New York Times*, September 9, 1983.
- (d) Thomas Murray, “The Coercive Power of Drugs in Sports *Hastings Center Report*, August 1983, 24 – 30.